

# PANORAMA

## **GENERAL ASSEMBLY At THE 27<sup>TH</sup> IPC CONFERENCE**

**FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 21, 2018**

**15:00-16:30 at Greenpark Hotel Taksim, Istanbul (Turkey)**

### **– MEETING MINUTES –**

#### **Attendees:**

Jonathan Biz Medina, Thiago Leitão de Souza, Patrícia dos Santos Castro, Teninlan Sarlybek, Patrick Deicher, Marina Zboevskaya, Melissa Wolfe, Dominique Hanson, Gábor Truda, Tamás Kardos, Sylvia Alting van Geusau, Jean Claude Brunner, Suzanne Wray, Sara Velas, Yit Chandaroat, Guy Thewes, Bekir Sitki Severoglu, Serdar Murat Gursel, Ruby Calson, Seth Thompson.

#### **Agenda**

1. Opening of the Assembly and approval of the Agenda
2. Approval of the minutes of the last General Assembly
3. Annual report of the President and the Executive Board
4. Annual financial statements including Auditors' Report
5. Fiscal discharge of the Executive Board
6. Elections
  - a. Secretary-General
  - b. Vice President
  - c. At-large Executive Board members
7. Election of the auditors
8. 2017-2018 Accomplishments and Goal Setting
9. Membership fees for 2018
10. Information on the budget outlines 2017 and 2018
11. Awarding plaques and certificates for 2018 Presentations from conference attendees
12. Updates from IPC Members
13. Closing of the Assembly

## **Minutes**

### **1. Opening of the Assembly and approval of the Agenda**

Opening of the General Assembly of 21 September 2018 by President Seth Thompson. Agenda approved with no items added.

### **2. Approval of the minutes of the last General Assembly**

Minutes of the General Assembly on 1 October 2017 are motioned to approve by Seth Thompson and the minutes are approved.

### **3. Annual report of the President and the Executive Board**

Seth Thompson: Recognized Salih Dogan and Ruby Calson for their efforts in organizing the 27th International Panorama Council Conference. Thanked Sylvia Alting van Geusau, Blagovesta Momchedjikova, Thiago Leitão, and Sara Velas for their contribution in making the International Panorama Council Journal, Volume 1 possible. Also thanked the following people for being a member on one or more of these committees: Sylvia Alting van Geusau, Molly Briggs, Ruby Carlson, Mimi Colligan, Patrick Deicher, Salih Dogan, Dominique Hanson, Gabriele Koller, Thiago Leitao de Souza, Blagovesta Momchedjikova, Guy Thewes, Gabor Turda, Sara Velas and Suzanne Wray. Discussed the goals for 2018-2019: 1. Publish the book "More than Meets the Eye – The Magic of the Panorama," which is an aggregate publication of selected conference papers from 2005-2015 edited by Gabriele Koller, with Patrick Deicher's fundraising support; 2. Continue to develop a "European Cultural Route of Panoramas," potentially certified by the Council of Europe; 3. Formalize the activities of the Executive Board with the further development of committees and Standing Rules in order to have greater continuity from year-to-year and build upon the expertise of our membership base; 4. Continue our core IPC activities, which include our annual conference, newsletter, books and now journal; 5. Develop the International Panorama Council's Advisory Board. Mentions the next Conference: 28th IPC (2019), Atlanta History Center, Atlanta, Georgia, EUA. Mentions 30th IPC (2021), New Bedford Whaling Museum, Mass., EUA. Mentions the 29th IPC (2020) and 31st (2022) conferences still looking for a host, if a member in the General Assembly wants to host the IPC in these years, please contact the President or the Secretary-General. On behalf of the International Panorama Council's Executive Board and Secretary-General, I would like to share with you not only the accomplishments of the IPC within the past year, but also our goals.

First of all, I would like to thank our 27th International Panorama Council Conference hosts in Istanbul Turkey for helping create an excellent conference. Their hospitality, graciousness and attention to detail were remarkable. I would like to especially thank: Ahmet Selamet, Vice

President, Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality; Kemal Kaptaner, General Manager, The Istanbul Municipality Culture CO.; Salih Doğan, Museum Manager, Panorama 1453; İbrahim Yüksek, Business Chief, Panorama 1453; Haşim Vatandaş, Project Coordinator, Panorama 1453; and Mustafa Dündar, Mayor, Bursa, Osmangazi.

A major undertaking this year was the introduction of the International Panorama Council Journal. Volume 1, which was published in January 2018. Readers of IPC's journal can download a digital copy for free or purchase an on-demand print copy through IPC's website. With the assistance of Blagovesta Momchedjikova, Sylvia Alting van Geusau, Thiago Leitão de Souza, this publication would have not have been possible, as we created the Journal from the ground up. I would also like to thank Past President Sara Velas for her trust and support as we began the development of the Journal under her leadership. Lastly, I would also like to thank the eleven authors who contributed their 2017 IPC Conference papers to the International Panorma Council Journal, Volume 1.

The International Panorama Council's immediate goals include:

1. Publishing our anticipated book entitled, "More than Meets the Eye – The Magic of the Panorama," which is an aggregate publication of selected conference papers from 2005-2015 edited by Gabriele Koller. This project was initiated by Patrick Deicher and will be an exciting addition to our list of IPC publications. It is anticipated that the book will be published by the end of 2018!
2. Create a "European Cultural Route of Panoramas," potentially certified by the Council of Europe. Under the leadership of Vice President Guy Thewes, we have begun soliciting panorama organizations to see if they would be interested in participating. Please help support us in this very important endeavor.
3. Continue our core IPC activities, which include our annual conference, newsletter, books and now journal.

Since we are primarily a volunteer-run membership organization, we have been working to formalize the activities of the Executive Board in order to have greater continuity from year-to-year and build upon the expertise of our membership base. As a result, this past year, we introduced committees into our structure on a trial basis to help delegate work and provide for a more inclusive environment for decision-making. I would like to thank the following people for being a member on one or more of these committees: Sylvia Alting van Geusau, Molly Briggs, Ruby Carlson, Mimi Colligan, Patrick Deicher, Salih Dogan, Dominique Hanson, Gabriele Koller, Thiago Leitao de Souza, Blagovesta Momchedjikova, Guy Thewes, Gabor Turda, Sara Velas and Suzanne Wray. We plan to continue developing these Committees in the upcoming year.

If you would like to participate on a committee, write for our quarterly newsletter or contribute your expertise to help with the success of the International Panorama Council, please contact the Secretary-General Ruby Carlson ([secretary@panoramacouncil.org](mailto:secretary@panoramacouncil.org)) or myself ([president@panoramacouncil.org](mailto:president@panoramacouncil.org)).

The IPC Executive Board also began introducing Standing Rules. Since there were no formal guidelines for the IPC Executive Board beyond the IPC Statues and Activity Distribution Chart that

help guide the organization in decision-making, operations, and proposing new activities, the IPC Executive Board has adopted the notion of Standing Rules, which are policies and procedures that will help fairly and effectively manage operations and fall in-line with the IPC statutes. In addition, the Executive Board held regular Board meetings throughout the year.

As reported last year, IPC needs to expand its membership in order to continue and grow our offerings. Please help IPC by soliciting new members—both individuals and institutions—so that we may continue our efforts and grow. We depend on these funds to offset our conference costs, provide the Secretary-General with a modest honorarium, and engage in new activities that will benefit the panorama community such as the “European Cultural Route of Panoramas.”

I wish to thank Secretary-General Ruby Carlson and the IPC Executive Board (Vice President Guy Thewes; Treasurer Dominique Hanson; and At-Large Members: Blagovesta Momchedjikova, Mathias Thiel, Thiago Leitão, and Gabor Turda) for all their hard work this past year.

The 2018/2019 International Panorama Council Executive Board composition is the following:

President: Seth Thompson (2017-2020)

Vice President: Guy Thewes (2018-2021)

Treasurer: Dominique Hanson (2017-2020)

At-Large Members: Blagovesta Momchedjikova (2018-2021); Gabor Turda (2017-2020); Sara Velas (2017-2020).

Secretary-General: Thiago Leitão (2018-2021—term begins January 1, 2019)

It should be noted that the one remaining Executive Board opening spots will be filled in 2019. We will be posting a call for nominations in the spring. If you would like to discuss this opportunity to contribute to IPC, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Ruby Carlson will be finishing her tenure as the Secretary-General on December 31, 2018. On behalf of the IPC Executive Board, I wish to thank her for all her hard work. I would also like to thank Mathias Thiel for serving on the IPC Executive Board for the past three years.

An important component of IPC’s success is the continued development of an Advisory Board. The Advisory Board is appointed by the President in conjunction with the Executive Board, to gain added strategic guidance on matters related to panoramas & the international cultural landscape. If you wish to share your expertise as an IPC Advisory Board member, please contact the Secretary-General Ruby Carlson ([secretary@panoramacouncil.org](mailto:secretary@panoramacouncil.org)) or myself ([president@panoramacouncil.org](mailto:president@panoramacouncil.org)) and let us know how you would like to contribute to IPC.

Current members of the IPC Advisory Board are:

\*Sylvia Alting van Geusau (Former IPC Secretary-General, Stichting Intermin, The Netherlands)

\*Ruby Carlson (Former IPC Secretary-General, Velaslavasay Panorama, USA—beginning January 1, 2019)

\*Yit Chandaroat (Angkor Panorama Museum, Cambodia)

\*Patrick Deicher (Former IPC Secretary-General & Treasurer, BDO Ltd., Switzerland)

\*Salih Doğan (Panorama 1453 History Museum, Turkey)

\*Molly Briggs, Phd. (University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA)

\*Ji Yunhui (LuXun Academy of Fine Arts, China)

Lastly, we have hosts established for the 2019 and 2021 IPC Conferences, but are still seeking a local partner for 2020. Here are the planned dates for our conferences over the next three years:

28th IPC Conference: September 25-27, 2019, Atlanta History Center, Atlanta, Georgia, USA

29th IPC Conference: Fall 2020, Host TBD

30th IPC Conference: September 15-17, 2021, New Bedford Whaling Museum, New Bedford, Massachusetts, USA

If you would like to host either the 2020 or 2022 conferences, please contact the Secretary-General Ruby Carlson ([secretary@panoramacouncil.org](mailto:secretary@panoramacouncil.org)) or myself ([president@panoramacouncil.org](mailto:president@panoramacouncil.org)) so that we may begin discussion regarding the benefits and responsibilities of hosting an IPC Conference.

#### **4. Annual financial statements including Auditors' Report**

Treasurer Dominique Hanson explains the annual financial result for 2017: Grateful to Patrick Deicher for his help and support. Presents the balance of 2017. Discusses difficulties with the PostFinance card and the financial problems of the organization. Presents the financial statement. Mentions difficulty in managing the membership fee due to lack of link between PayPal and Post Finance system with members' emails. Grateful to Salih Dogan and his team for their hospitality. In 2019: IPC will probably have 10.000-11.000 euro. The first priority is ensuring that the Secretary-General expenses are covered for the year. Priority targets: 1. Increase the number of institutions and collect memberships ASAP; 2. Atlanta Conference: budget ASAP with different scenario about number of participants; 3 Create Excel spreadsheets for managing the income and / or expense for the Annual balance respecting the Swiss law. This task will be developed with Patrick Deicher's support. In conclusion, IPC can consider at the end of 2018 that the costs of the Secretary-General can be covered for 2019 due to the total hospitality of our Turkish friends.

	Budget 2018	Result 2017	Budget 2017 (as of 28 Sept 2016)	Result 2016
	EUR	EUR	EUR	EUR
<b>Membership</b>	<b>10'500.00</b>	<b>9'700.00</b>	<b>10'450.00</b>	<b>10'066.50</b>
Annual Membership fees	10'500.00	9'700.00	10'450.00	10'066.50
Advertising to gain members	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>International Panorama Conference</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>-1'858.10</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>-1'616.45</b>
Income from International Panorama Conference	10'000.00	11'161.30	10'000.00	5'350.00
Organisation of International Panorama Conference	-10'000.00	-13'019.40	-10'000.00	-6'966.45
<b>PR and Publications</b>	<b>-4'700.00</b>	<b>-3'358.80</b>	<b>-26'000.00</b>	<b>-149.95</b>
Expenses for Newsletter	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Expenses for Publications	-5'000.00	-3'325.00	-26'000.00	-114.50
Income from Publication sales	400.00	190.00	100.00	150.00
Expenses for general media and PR work	-100.00	0.00	-100.00	0.00
Expenses for Webpage	0.00	-223.80	0.00	-185.45
<b>Projects and Services</b>	<b>-1'000.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>-1'000.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
Income from Projects and Services	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Project Flyer 'Panoramas worldwide'	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Diverse projects according to annual strategic plan	-1'000.00	0.00	-1'000.00	0.00
<b>Fundraising</b>	<b>5'050.00</b>	<b>100.00</b>	<b>21'050.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
Donations	5'000.00	100.00	21'000.00	0.00
Sponsoring	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Expenses for Fundraising activities	50.00	0.00	50.00	0.00
<b>Other Income</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
Diverse revenues	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>Salaries of Administration and other personal expenses</b>	<b>-9'500.00</b>	<b>-10'074.55</b>	<b>-9'500.00</b>	<b>-9'197.68</b>
Salaries	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Fees for third parties	-8'000.00	-10'074.55	-8'000.00	-8'043.27
Travel and meal expenses	-1'500.00	0.00	-1'500.00	-1'154.41
Divers Personnel expenses	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>Administrative Expenses</b>	<b>-500.00</b>	<b>-144.93</b>	<b>-950.00</b>	<b>-48.35</b>
Office materials, printing, photocopies	-100.00	-27.89	-200.00	0.00
Literature	0.00	0.00	-100.00	0.00
phone, fax, Internet-connection	-50.00	0.00	-50.00	-48.35
postage	-350.00	-117.04	-350.00	0.00
Other administrative expenses	0.00	0.00	-250.00	0.00
Fees for Consultants	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>Other Expenses of the Association</b>	<b>-1'800.00</b>	<b>-74.73</b>	<b>-1'800.00</b>	<b>-1'734.08</b>
Executive Board (costs for meetings and travel)	-1'500.00	0.00	-1'500.00	-1'734.08
Organisation of General Assembly	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Membership fees with other organisations	-300.00	-74.73	-300.00	0.00
Annual report (print and envoy)	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Other expenses	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Auditing	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>Business Premises</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
<b>Purchases, Maintenance, Repairs</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
Purchases, Maintenance, Repairs	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>Insurances, Fees</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>-215.39</b>
<b>Depreciation</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
<b>Other Finance Costs and Income</b>	<b>-545.00</b>	<b>-255.16</b>	<b>-645.00</b>	<b>-409.36</b>
Bank charges	-350.00	0.00	-50.00	-343.19
Credit Card payment expenses (PayPal)	-200.00	-295.18	-200.00	-150.35
Foreign Currency Exchange loss	0.00	0.00	-400.00	0.00
Bank interest, Income from cash	5.00	0.00	5.00	0.00
Foreign Currency Exchange gain	0.00	40.02	0.00	84.18
<b>Extraordinary Result</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
Extraordinary Income	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Extraordinary Expenses	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>Taxes</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
<b>ANNUAL FINANCIAL RESULT</b>	<b>-2'495.00</b>	<b>-5'966.27</b>	<b>-8'395.00</b>	<b>-3'304.76</b>
<b>Total loss/profit</b>				
Total Income	25'905.00	21'191.32	41'555.00	15'650.68
Total Expenses	28'400.00	27'157.59	49'950.00	18'955.44

<b>BALANCE SHEET</b>	<b>31 Dec 2018</b>	<b>31 Dec 2017</b>	<b>31 Dec 2017</b>	<b>31 Dec 2016</b>
<b>ASSETS</b>	<b>EUR</b>	<b>EUR</b>	<b>EUR</b>	<b>EUR</b>
<b>CURRENT ASSETS</b>		<b>14'092.14</b>		<b>12'627.51</b>
<b>Cash and equivalents and securities</b>		<b>14'091.14</b>		<b>12'626.51</b>
Pettycash EUR		0.00		0.00
Pettycash USD		0.00		0.00
Pettycash CHF		0.00		0.00
Bank PostFinance CH74 0900 0000 6041 4391 4 (CHF) (no longer existing since 2017)		-		0.00
Bank PostFinance CH77 0900 0000 9139 3130 5 (EUR)		7'735.60		12'626.51
PayPal account (EUR)		939.27		0.00
PayPal account (CHF)		0.00		0.00
PayPal Account (USD)		5'416.27		0.00
Bank Cheques		0.00		0.00
<b>Accounts receivable</b>		<b>0.00</b>		<b>0.00</b>
Accounts receivable		0.00		0.00
<b>Inventories</b>		<b>1.00</b>		<b>1.00</b>
Inventories publications		1.00		1.00
<b>Accrued assets</b>		<b>0.00</b>		<b>0.00</b>
Prepaid assets		0.00		0.00
<b>FIXED ASSETS</b>		<b>0.00</b>		<b>0.00</b>
<b>Financial Assets</b>		<b>0.00</b>		<b>0.00</b>
Securities (Investments)		0.00		0.00
<b>TOTAL ASSETS</b>		<b>14'092.14</b>		<b>12'627.51</b>
<b>LIABILITIES</b>				<b>EUR</b>
<b>Short-term liabilities</b>		<b>7'430.90</b>		<b>0.00</b>
Creditor		7'430.90		0.00
<b>Accrued liabilities (short-term)</b>		<b>0.00</b>		<b>0.00</b>
Accrued liabilities (short-term)		0.00		0.00
<b>Association's assets</b>		<b>12'627.51</b>		<b>15'932.27</b>
Association's assets per 1 January		12'627.51		15'932.27
<b>Annual financial result</b>		<b>-5'966.27</b>		<b>-3'304.76</b>
Total loss /profit		-5'966.27		-3'304.76
<b>TOTAL LIABILITIES</b>		<b>14'092.14</b>		<b>12'627.51</b>

## 5. Fiscal discharge of the Executive Board

The financial statements have not been audited by the team of auditors. A financial discharge of the Executive Board is therefore not possible. The audit of the financial statements should be carried out as quickly as possible. The result is to be presented to the next General Assembly.

Jean-Claude Brunner asked about the Excel: "day by day expenses"? Patrick Deicher clarifies. Dominique Hanson mentions that Natasja Peeters and Gordon Jones are overwhelmed in their own work and didn't have time to audit the IPC's documents. Dominique Hanson says the documents will be finished and reviewed by the auditors. Jean-Claude Brunner says that in order to discharge the Executive Board, the auditor's position needs to be taken in consideration. Patrick Deicher suggests postponing the question for next year. Seth Thompson suggests approving in spirit. Vote: General Assembly agreed, 1 denied. The question comes again. Jean-Claude Brunner offers his help to auditors. Seth Thompson made a motion to approve adding Jean-Claude Brunner as a potential auditor. The motion was seconded. The vote to add Jean-Claude Brunner as a third auditor was approved by everyone.

## 6. Elections

Leaving the Board 2018:

At-Large Matthias Thiel, Germany

At-Large Thiago Leitão, Brazil

Secretary General Ruby Carlson, USA

Staying on the Board:

President Seth Thompson, UAE (2018-2020)

Treasurer Dominique Hanson, Belgium (2018-2020)

At-Large Gabor Turda, Hungary (2018-2020)

At-Large Sara Velas, USA (2018-2020)

The Assembly elects the following persons:

At-Large Blagovesta Momchedjikova, USA (2019-2021), Vice President Guy Thewes, Luxembourg (2019-2021), Secretary-General Thiago Leitão, Brazil (2019-2021)

## **7. Election of the auditors**

The Assembly elects the following persons: Gordon Jones, USA, Natasja Peeters, Belgium & Jean-Claude Brunner, Austria

## **8. 2017-2018 Accomplishments and Goal Setting**

Presentation of "Cultural Roads of Europe" project presented by Guy Thewes.

## **9. Membership fees for 2018**

Membership fees are agreed:

Individual members EUR 50 (2018: 50)

Student members EUR 25 (2018: 25)

Institutional members EUR 1'000 (2018: 1'000)

Supporting members EUR 2'000 (2018: 2'000)

## **10. Information on the budget outlines 2017 and 2018**

Not budget outlines available



### **11. Awarding plaques and certificates for 2018**

Angkor Panorama Museum in Cambodia is recognized as a new Institutional Member. Yit Chandaroat accepts Institutional Membership plaque on behalf of the Angkor Panorama Museum. Continuing Institutional Members were also recognized.

Certificates of Appreciation Presentation: Certificates of appreciation were given to Mathias Thiel, Ruby Carlson and Sara Velas for their service contributions to IPC.

### **12. Presentations from conference attendees**

Presentation on the Panorama of the Monumental Grandeur of the Mississippi Valley by Melissa Wolfe, Curator of American Art at the St Louis Art Museum.

### **13. Updates from IPC Members**

Roger Hallett who has died on 1 August 2018 at Salies de Béarn in South-West France at the age of 89 was a British painter and as a panorama artist unique at a time when the knowledge of how to paint panoramas had almost completely been forgotten in the artistic world. To members of the IPC he will be remembered for having attended several panorama conferences.

### **14. Closing of the Assembly**

The conference is closed at 4:21 pm.

Responsible for the minutes:

Ruby Carlson, Secretary-General

Minutes recorded by Thiago Leitão de Souza