

PANORAMA

International Panorama Council

General Assembly 29th International Panorama Council Conference Meeting Minutes

Date: Friday October 16, 2020

Time: 16:20 – 17:20 GMT

Place: Online at the conclusion of the 29th International Panorama Council Conference

Attendees: Alexander Lavrov, Alexey Druzhinin, Anja Coenen, Blagovesta Momchedjikova, Éloïse Paquette, Emek Yılmaz, Emile Mermillod, Evelyn Onnes-Fruitema, Gabriele Koller, Gordon Jones, Gökhan Maraşlıoğlu, Guy Thewes, Irina Gribova, Jean-Claude Brunner, Juliane Voigt, Katarina Andjelkovic, Lisa Stone, Liz Crooks, Mário Cesar Coelho, Massimiliano Gaudiosi, Melissa Wolfe, Molly Catherine Briggs, Mustafa Dündar, Nicholas Lowe, Onno Schilstra, Orhan Mollasalih, Peter Harrington, Robin Skinner, Salih Doğan, Sara Velas, Seth Thompson, Silvia Mascia, Suzanne Wray, Thiago Leitão, Thorsten Logge, Wim Hardeman, Zora O'Neill, and Çiğdem Arıcan.

Opening of the General Assembly by President Seth Thompson.

Approval of the agenda, with no items to add:

1. Call to Order.
2. Approval of the Agenda.
3. Approval of the 2019 General Assembly Meeting Minutes.
4. Executive Board/President's Report.
5. Annual Financial Statements including Auditors' Report.
6. Fiscal Discharge of the Executive Board.
7. Election of the Auditors.
8. Executive Board Elections for President and Treasurer for 2020- 2023 term
 - Nominations:
 - 8.1. Co-Presidents: Molly Catherine Briggs & Sara Velas.
 - 8.2. Treasurer: Dominique Hanson.
9. Advisory Board.
10. Approval of Membership Fees for 2021.
11. Information on Forthcoming Conferences.
12. Any Other Business.
13. Updates from IPC Members.
14. Adjournment.

1. Call to Order

General Assembly called to order at 16:15 by President Seth Thompson.

2. Approval of the Agenda

President Seth Thompson presented the agenda. The General Assembly agrees and the minutes are approved by everyone

3. Approval of the 2019 General Assembly Meeting Minutes

The General Assembly agrees and the minutes are approved by everyone.

4. Executive Board/President's Report

On behalf of the International Panorama Council's Executive Board and Secretary-General, I would like to share with you our accomplishments from this past year.

While the pandemic halted many aspirations this year, the Executive Board and the Panorama 1326 Bursa Conquest Museum worked together to ensure that our annual conference schedule was not disrupted. I would like to thank the Panorama 1326 Bursa Conquest Museum for hosting the 29th International Panorama Council Conference as well as the support provided by the Bursa-Osmangazi Municipality in this endeavor. Their flexibility and understanding in allowing us to switch to an online conference due to the coronavirus pandemic made for a smooth transition online. Together, we made a good collective decision for the safety of both our conference participants and host country due to the coronavirus pandemic.

The 29th International Panorama Council Conference took place online, October 14th through 16th 2020. This year's conference addressed broad topics related to the panorama, which included: The Panorama Phenomenon in Turkey; Panoramic Innovations: From Drawing to Virtuality; Enlivening the Panorama: Lights, Movement, Architecture; Conserving the Bygone Era for the Future; Panoramic Narratives of Landscapes and Power; and Panoramic Entertainment: Between Reality and Fiction. In addition to the wonderful and thought-provoking presentations and discussions at the conference, other highlights included opening remarks by Bursa's Mayor, Mr. Mustafa Duñdar and a virtual tour of the Panorama 1326 Bursa Conquest Museum. I would like to thank Orhan Mollasalih and Dr. Emek Yılmaz of the Panorama 1326 Bursa Conquest Museum for helping to bring this conference to fruition. On IPC's side, the tireless efforts of Thiago Leitão de Souza, Dom Hanson, Blagovesta Momchedjikova, Molly Briggs, Sara Velas and Melissa Wolfe need to be acknowledged, as their conscientious work helped make the conference a great success.

In January 2020, we successfully published the *International Panorama Council Journal*, Volume 3, which features 14 selected essays from last year's conference in Atlanta, Georgia. Readers of the *Journal* may download a digital copy for free or purchase an on-demand print copy through our website. I wish to thank Sylvia Alting van Geusau, Molly Briggs, Thiago Leitao de Souza and Blagovesta Momchedjikova for their contributions with making the *Journal* a success.

While limited headway was made with the European Cultural Route of Panoramas' initiative due the pandemic, Sara Velas, Chair of the Technical Committee, worked to populate this new committee set up to continue IPC's leadership role in panorama conservation and technical advocacy. In addition to Sara Velas, Dom Hanson, Irina Gribova, and Yit

Chandaroat are members of this important developing committee.

I would like to thank the following people for contributing their time and experience to the International Panorama Council this past year: Sylvia Alting van Geusau, Jean-Claude Brunner, Anja Coenen, Patrick Deicher, Salih Dogan, Irina Gribova, Gordon Jones, Gabriele Koller, Melissa Wolfe, and Yit Chandaroat.

I would like to especially thank Secretary-General Thiago Leitão de Souza and the Executive Board (Vice President Guy Thewes; Treasurer Dominique Hanson; and At-Large Members: Blagovesta Momchedjikova, Gabor Turda and Sara Velas) for all their hard work this past year.

This year Dominique Hanson, Treasurer, At-Large Executive Board members Gabor Turda and Sara Velas and I, as the Council's President, have completed our terms of service on the Executive Board. Sara Velas has renewed her commitment to serve along with Molly Briggs as Co-Presidents. Dom Hanson will continue his service as IPC's Treasurer for another three years. All were elected to serve in these capacities at the 2020 General Assembly. While Gabor Turda and I have stepped down from the Executive Board, we will continue serving the International Panorama Council as Advisory Board members.

As a result, I am pleased to report that the 2020/2021 International Panorama Council Executive Board composition is the following:

- Co-Presidents: Molly Catherine Briggs (2020-2023) & Sara Velas (2020-2023)
- Vice President: Guy Thewes (2018-2021)
- Treasurer: Dominique Hanson (2020-2023)
- At-Large Members: Blagovesta Momchedjikova (2018-2021)
- Secretary-General: Thiago Leitão de Souza

Next year, the term for the Vice President will end and an election will take place for this seat as well as an At-Large seat. Both of these roles play a crucial part in the success of the International Panorama Council. If you would like to contribute to the International Panorama Council in one of these capacities, I strongly encourage you to do so.

Additionally, an important component of the Council's success is the continued development of an Advisory Board. The Advisory Board is appointed by the President in conjunction with the Executive Board to gain added strategic guidance on matters related to panoramas & the international cultural landscape. Current members of the International Panorama Council Advisory Board are:

- Sylvia Alting van Geusau (Former IPC Secretary-General, Stichting Intermin, The Netherlands)
- Ruby Carlson (Former IPC Secretary-General, Velaslavasay Panorama, USA)
- Yit Chandaroat (Angkor Panorama Museum, Cambodia)
- Patrick Deicher (Former IPC Secretary-General & Treasurer, BDO Ltd., Switzerland)
- Salih Doğan (Panorama 1453 History Museum, Turkey)
- Gabriele Koller (Curator of the Museum Panorama Altötting, Germany)
- Ji Yunhui (LuXun Academy of Fine Arts, China)
- Seth Thompson (Associate Professor, Department of Art and Design, American University of Sharjah, Sharjah, United Arab Emirates)
- Gábor Turda (Leader of the operational group at Ópusztaszer National Heritage Park, Hungary)

Over the past three years, the International Panorama Council has accomplished a great deal, as it has: published the book, *More than Meets the Eye – The Magic of the Panorama*; established a rigorous conference proceedings journal, created a scientific committee to review conference presentation proposals, signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with The Sector of Museums-Custodians of Panoramas and Dioramas (Russia), and has made great strides with the European Cultural Route of Panoramas' initiative, to name a few.

Lastly, for the next four years, we have identified hosts for the following conferences:

- 30th IPC Conference, New Bedford Whaling Museum, United States, Sept. 15-17, 2021;
- 31st IPC Conference, Lëtzebuerg City Museum, Luxembourg, Fall 2022 dates TBD;
- 32nd IPC Conference, University of Iowa, United States, Fall 2023 dates TBD;
- 33rd IPC Conference, City of Güglingen, Germany, Fall 2024 dates TBD.

With this in mind, I am happy to report that I am leaving the International Panorama Council's Executive Board in good hands with professionals committed to the history and conservation of the panorama including its current relevance and development. Their strategic plan presented at the 2020 General Assembly shows that the Council has a great future ahead of it. Please help them make this vision a reality. If you would like to contribute your expertise to help with the success of the International Panorama Council, please contact the Secretary-General, Thiago Leitão de Souza (secretary@panoramacouncil.org) or Co-Presidents, Molly Briggs and Sara Velas (president@panoramacouncil.org).

Thank you.

President Seth Thompson is applauded by the General Assembly.

5. Annual Financial Statements including Auditors' Report

Introduction:

In his conclusions of the financial report 2018, the auditor Jean-Claude Brunner, had pointed out that the losses incurred that year were masked by the donation for the book edition. As in previous years, the interpretation and analysis of the financial balance as at 31.12.2019 is once again not very simple. Special attention was paid to the institutional memberships. It should be noted that these are the majority of IPC's income. The amount reported is the result of movements in opposite directions: loyal members, departing members and new members. On a strictly ad hoc level, the final closure of the "book edition" case was finally postponed to 2020. In the meantime, transfers between the donation amount and the printer have been made. The fundraising formula has been abandoned and IPC's contribution amounts to 5,000 euros.

Charges to financial institutions, especially PayPal, are a cause for concern. What actions should be taken while maintaining practicality? The analysis of the software used to manage subscriptions, invoicing, receipts and membership lists is in progress.

Revenues 2019:

Asisi paid 4 institutional contributions for 2018 during the year 2019. As for his contributions for 2019 a positive response is expected in 2020.

Three new institutions have joined IPC for 2019: Borodino, Bursa and Angkor. Asisi's dominant position in terms of institutional income can therefore be revised downwards. Luxun Academy has not responded to our letters concerning the 2019 membership fee. The same goes for the new management of Istanbul 1453 and Gazianthep has not yet contacted

us to clarify its intentions. In conclusion, the situation has improved at the level of the majority donors, our institutional members: a diversification has taken place but the evaluation remains mixed and must be cautious.

Expenses 2019:

The printing of the book has been completed. Delivery to Patrick Deicher/BDO (transport and import) was assured but delivery to the panoramas was problematic. The last invoice definitively closing this file should not be issued until early 2020. It should be noted that Patrick Deicher will take over part of the work according to his commitments. Let us therefore thank him once again very warmly.

Bank charges:

Bank charges were reduced in the year under review by avoiding transfers from PayPal to Post Finance as much as possible. The remaining reserve, which was placed in PayPal and mentioned in the declaration to the Swiss Tax Office, could be used to pay the expenses related to the Atlanta Conference. The organizer agreed to be reimbursed in one transfer to his PayPal account. Exchanges between PayPal accounts do, of course, involve charges. These are charged to the receiver, but they are much less than if a transfer is made to another financial institution. In other words, PayPal is greedier when IPC receives fees than Post Finance and becomes even heavier when IPC leaves the PayPal system.

Atlanta Conference (September 2019):

The intense preparation with Gordon Jones, through different simulations during the preparatory phase, allowed the setting of registration fees in order to arrive at a realistic and balanced budget. In addition, as a result of Gordon's subsequent negotiations with logistics and suppliers, a net profit was made, leading to a completely self-sufficient conference (General Secretary's expenses, gifts etc.). From a financial point of view, Atlanta is an example to follow in terms of collaboration with the host organizer and logistical and financial preparation. The same process was immediately re-launched for the 2020 conference with Bursa.

General Secretary:

Following the signing in mid-year of the contract binding the only candidate for the post of IPC General Secretary, an honorarium was sent to him. Unfortunately, it turned out that the Brazilian bank charges related to this honorarium as well as their taxation proved to be particularly high (+/-30%). A solution should be sought in this respect! All suggestions are welcome. Here also the payment operated in two times and not by trimester brings some economy.

Turn-over/Reserve:

As the balance sheet and the statement show, the weakening of the actual cash position/turnover at the end of 2019 is, in fact, concealed again. In other words, we have to be "realistic". As far as the financial accounts for the year in question are concerned, the comparison between the amounts for 1 January and 31 December speaks for itself!

In order to try to draw up a possible 2020 budget, it is preferable to list and focus on recurring items and priority "one-shot" operations, while remaining open to a positive contingency that will nevertheless have to be kept under control.

Many uncertainties or approximations remain. If the order of magnitude of the closing of the account with the printer is foreseeable, what will be the attitude of Asisi, the Chinese, Gaziantep, and Istanbul...?

The collaboration with Bursa and a lower cost of living in Turkey than in the USA does not, on the contrary, jeopardize the assumption of the post of General Secretary, nor that of the Journal's edition, nor the travel expenses of the President and the Secretary. The collaboration with Bursa, which is already well underway, is promising and promises to be beneficial in terms of the funds set aside.

This last-mentioned should have two objectives:

- To have the honorarium for the post of General Secretary available by the end of 2020 for his payment in 2021;
- An update/upgrade of the website, which is more than necessary.

As in Istanbul and Atlanta, the exclamation "We are border line, but IPC is still alive and IPC is living" remains not only relevant but also forward-looking. Our projects, yes we may continue to have projects, must receive a priority rank and a very carefully studied budget, a real strategy plan, the more in these troubled times.

Treasurer Dominique Hanson is applauded by the General Assembly.
The following documents will be added at the end of these minutes:

- Post Finance Mouvements 2019 Voucher 01 - 01/01/2019 – 31/12/2019;
- PayPal Mouvements 2019 Voucher 02 - 01/01/2019 – 31/12/2019;
- Tax Certificates 2019 – Post Finance & PayPal;
- Daybook 2019;
- Budget Statement 2019 – Result 2019 – Budget 2020;
- Balance Sheet 2019 ;
- Auditors Report 2019 – JC-Brunner & Dr. G Jones;
- Financial Report 2019 – Submitted to the auditors;
- Vouchers 2019 – Justifications / Invoices ;
- Vouchers 2019 – Accounts Charges.

6. Fiscal Discharge of the Executive Board

President Seth Thompson makes a motion. The General Assembly agrees and the Fiscal discharge of the Executive Board is approved by everyone.

7. Election of the Auditors

President Seth Thompson presents the following names:

- Gordon Jones (USA);
- Jean-Claude Brunner (Austria).

The General Assembly agrees and the auditor's names are approved by everyone.

8. Executive Board Elections for President and Treasurer for 2020- 2023 term Nominations:

President Seth Thompson presents the candidates Molly Catherine Briggs & Sara Velas as co-presidents for 2020-2023. Seth Thompson reads a small resume of them: Molly Catherine Briggs has Interdisciplinary administrative experience, scholarly and artistic background, and publishes on landscape and media studies; Sara Velas is founding director of nonprofit panorama museum, has extensive contacts with global networked panorama community and legacy of participation in IPC since 2004 and past IPC President.

Molly Catherine Briggs & Sara Velas asked the word to present their IPC Visioning 2020-2023: Notes Toward a Three-Year Plan.

8.1. Co-Presidents: Molly Catherine Briggs & Sara Velas

Molly Briggs and Sara Velas present to the General Assembly a detailed Strategic Plan for the IPC for the next three years. A synthesis of their plan is presented below.

They believe the IPC should grow in breadth and depth. We should build on IPC's long history, capitalize on recent successes, increase breadth and diversity, and deepen our service to specialized stakeholders, and specially, different yet related services to constituents through our varied activities. These services would include: networking by all Executive Board members; grow our community; individual memberships; larger and increasingly diverse conference cohort; and new online newsletter platform.

Molly Briggs and Sara Velas believe the IPC we must increase the value of institutional memberships, such as: more activity outside of the conference; develop the Cultural Routes program; create an Interactive map; develop a communications strategy; and activate Technical Committee. Other proposed actions are: deepen our scholarly credibility; increased conference participation and increased Journal selectivity; and Scholarly-press book proposal(s).

They continue: the IPC should maximize existing administrative capacity with its teamwork, increasing participation in existing committees, developing a mentorship and a streamlined infrastructure. We must coordinate our communications in IPC Website, in Social Media, in our email system, and in an online Newsletter, developing a new model and system.

For annual conferences, we should: administer existing partnerships; embrace diversity; cultivate heterogeneity; and existing Partnerships (2020: Bursa; 2021: New Bedford Whaling Museum; 2022: Luxembourg City Museum; 2023: develop conference at Iowa Museum of Natural History; 2024: Güglingen, Germany; 2025 + beyond: potential hosts). For annual conferences we also need to devise new frameworks and think how to IPC could handle a larger conference.

For publications the IPC Journal, we must: continue to build it; establish the structure of Editor-in-Chief and Associate Editors; maintain current production timeline, size, and status; Look into getting indexed. For other IPC books, we should: continue distributing *More than Meets the Eye – The Magic of the Panorama*; develop new themed scholarly-press proposal(s); and grow self-published print-on-demand popular offering(s).

For logistics and business operations, the IPC should: manage memberships; to have NGO filing requirements; develop a better email hosting making possible accessibility across continents; develop a cloud file hosting and its management; webmaster; budget growth; book sales; and committees' and board structures.

The Committees should be: Executive Committee; Executive Board & At-Large Members; Advisory Board; Conference Planning Committee; Conference Scientific Committee; Technical Committee; IPC Journal Editorial Board; Advocacy + Outreach Committee. Sara Velas and Molly Briggs described how each committee will work and presented a list of the current and the forthcoming members of these committees. The proposed of Advocacy + Outreach Committee is to coordinate communications, build networks, develop individual and institutional memberships. Sara Velas and Molly Briggs highlight that they are still seeking members for this important new committee.

And finally, they present how the co-presidency will work. They believe in transparent, collaborative, streamlined communications. The President's financial "benefits" will be divided, not doubled. They have an excellent working relationship with proposed Executive Committee and the Executive Board. They will do a trial for one year which can be reconsidered after this time.

Molly Briggs and Sara Velas are applauded by the General Assembly.

8.2. Treasurer: Dominique Hanson

President Seth Thompson presents the candidate Dominique Hanson as a treasurer for 2020-2023. Seth Thompson reads a small resume of him: Dominique Hanson is Commissariat Commémoration première Guerre mondiale, a Former Director General Musée Royale de l'Armée et d'Histoire Militaire Brussels, Belgium (Retired), and IPC Treasurer in 2017- 2020.

Dominique Hanson asked the word to present his Communication Plan. He did this plan and the presentation with Anja Coenen.

Dominique Hanson presents to the General Assembly a communication and Marketing plan for the IPC for the next three years. A synthesis of Dominique's plan is presented below.

In Dominique's vision IPC needs to reflect who we want to reach: just people involved with Panoramas? People in love with Panoramas? Artists? Researchers? Academics? Speakers? The definition of this target audience will allow us to set specific goals to reach all these people in different groups.

Dominique Hanson cites an example: a family who visits the Battle of Waterloo Memorial and sees the Panorama. This family could become an IPC member. But it would be possible? How would this family know about the IPC existence? We need to improve the IPC's communication with people and institutions.

Dominique Hanson points out that the IPC main communication channels are and could be: Website, Newsletter, Journal, Facebook, LinkedIn, Twitter, Instagram, Mailchimp, Blog and Youtube. Every outreach system must have a link to the others and every outreach channel has its own public, utility and denomination. With this integration, IPC would have more visits in its website developing a higher visibility.

For IPC website, we must have: a new lay-out; mapping of panoramas, with technical form with a possible link to tourist information, where a membership fee could be asked for; domain and hosting, possibly changing denomination for better finding & identification; webmaster(s); Google ads, referencing to IPC; a possibility for e-commerce; it must be updated quickly and when it's needed; it could have sections, for members, no members, kids & Panoramas and among others; a possible General Data Protection Regulation which is important for Europe and other countries.

For Marketing and Public Relations, IPC should have: selling books; considering that the Corona crisis will not be finished soon: Panorama masks to be sold; collaboration with tourist information or cities which have panoramas, like Panorama XXL and Rouen in France; world map of panoramas; an *Eventbrite* system, to promote conferences; Panorama Route: Europe, Russia, USA, Asia; among others.

The treasurer also proposes a new pricing of membership fees and what IPC could offer in

return. Dominique proposes five different categories: Amount 1 - 1000€, for Institutional members. The IPC could offer three individual memberships, logo on website, first place for publishing news (the institutional member needs to deliver it to IPC), short video of panorama on social medias, conference fee reduction, a representative member in a committee; Amount 2 - 500€, for Institutional members. The IPC could offer two individual memberships, logo on website, publishing news (the institutional member needs to deliver it to IPC), short video of panorama on social medias; Amount 3 - 200€. The IPC could offer one individual membership, logo on website, publishing news, short video of panorama on social medias; Amount 4 - 50€, for individual members; Amount 5 - 25€, for students.

And finally, Dominique Hanson also proposes a new pricing system for conference fees. Virtual conference (on time + replay). The amounts would be defined depending where the conference would be hold and the agreements signed with the local partners. The categories would be: Amount 1- full amount for non-members; Amount 2 - amount for members; Amount 3 - amount for speakers; Amount 4 - amount for students (non-members); Amount 5 - amount for students (members); Amount 6 - replay for non-members (amount membership fee) (1 minute video + slide to interest the people). The treasurer informs that an organization plan should be develop to realize all the proposals. A committee could be created and the Executive Board should invite any IPC member who is interested. This committee would report the Executive Board and the next co-presidents. Anja Coenen is voluntary for this committee.

Dominique Hanson is applauded by the General Assembly.

After the two presentations, Molly Catherine Briggs & Sara Velas, and Dominique Hanson & Anja Coenen, the President Seth Thompson opened the election. All candidates were elected and applauded by the General Assembly.

Seth Thompson presented the composition of the new Executive Board:

- Co-Presidents: Molly Catherine Briggs (2020-2023) & Sara Velas (2020-2023);
- Vice President: Guy Thewes (2018-2021);
- Treasurer: Dominique Hanson (2020-2023);
- At-Large Members: Blagovesta Momchedjikova (2018-2021);
- Secretary-General: Thiago Leitão de Souza.

The Executive Board members are applauded by the General Assembly.

9. Advisory Board

President Seth Thompson presents the Advisory Board existing members:

- Sylvia Alting van Geusau (The Netherlands)
- Ruby Carlson (USA)
- Salih Doğan (Turkey)
- Patrick Deicher (Switzerland)
- Gabriele Koller (Germany)
- Yit Chandaroat (Cambodia)
- Ji Yunhui (China)

President Seth Thompson presents the Advisory Board new members:

- Gábor Turda (Hungary)
Leader of the operational group at Ópusztaszer National Heritage Park (management and maintenance of exhibition units).
- Seth Thompson (USA/UAE)
Associate Professor, Department of Art and Design, American University of Sharjah, Sharjah, United Arab Emirates)

The General Assembly agrees and approves the existing members and the new members.

10. Approval of Membership Fees for 2021

President Seth Thompson presents the membership fees for 2020:

- Individual members EUR 50
- Student members EUR 25
- Institutional members EUR 1'000
- Supporting members EUR 2'000

The General Assembly agrees and the membership fees are approved by everyone.

11. Information on Forthcoming Conferences

President Seth Thompson presents the dates for the forthcoming conferences:

- 30th IPC Conference, New Bedford Whaling Museum, United States, Sept. 15-17, 2021
- 31st IPC Conference, Lëtzebuerg City Museum, Luxembourg, Fall 2022 dates TBD
- 32nd IPC Conference, (proposed) University of Iowa, United States, Fall 2023 dates TBD
- 33rd IPC Conference, (proposed) City of Güglingen, Germany, Fall 2024 dates TBD

The General Assembly agrees and the dates are approved by everyone.

12. Any Other Business

No additional items were discussed.

13. Updates from IPC Members

No additional items were presented.

14. Adjournment

No adjournments.

The General Assembly is closed at 17:35pm.

The next General Assembly will be in October 16, 2020.

The General Assembly Minutes were taken by the General-Secretary Thiago Leitão.